

FOUNDING EDITOR:

BIMAL K. MATILAL†

EDITOR:

PHYLLIS GRANOFF, Dept. of Religious Studies, McMaster University,
Hamilton, Ontario, Canada L8S 4K1

BOARD OF CONSULTING EDITORS:

KAMALESWAR BHATTACHARYA, Paris, France
JOHANNES BRONKHORST, Lausanne, Switzerland
GEORGE CARDONA, Philadelphia, Penn., U.S.A.
LUIS GOMEZ, Ann Arbor, Mich., U.S.A.
MINORU HARA, Tokyo, Japan
MASAAKI HATTORI, Kyoto, Japan
RICHARD HAYES, Montreal, PQ, Canada
DANIEL H.H. INGALLS, Harvard, Cambridge, Mass., U.S.A.
DONALD LOPEZ, Ann Arbor, Mich., U.S.A.
J. N. MOHANTY, Norman, Okla., U.S.A.
PATRICK OLIVELLE, Austin, Tex., U.S.A.
KARL H. POTTER, Seattle, Wash., U.S.A.
D. SEYFORT RUEGG, London, England
DAVID SHULMAN, Jerusalem, Israel
J. F. STAAL, Berkeley, Calif., U.S.A.

printed on acid free paper

ISSN 0022-1791

All Rights Reserved

©1999 Kluwer Academic Publishers

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or by any information storage and retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

Printed in the Netherlands

JOURNAL OF INDIAN PHILOSOPHY

Volume 27 Nos. 1/2 February/April 1999

Special issue

Guruvandana: Essays in Indology
in Honour of K. Bhattacharya

PHYLLIS GRANOFF / Introduction	1-3
Kamaleswar Bhattacharya Bibliography	5-16
AKIHIKO AKAMATSU / The Two Kinds of <i>Anumāna</i> in Bhartṛhari's <i>Vākyapadīya</i>	17-22
JOHANNES BRONKHORST / Studies on Bharṭṛhari, 8: Prākṛta Dhvani and the Sāṃkhya Tanmātras	23-33
ANDRÉ COUTURE / The Problem of the Meaning of Yoganidrā's Name	35-47
MINORU HARA / A Note on the Phrase Dharma-Kṣetre Kuru-Kṣetra	49-66
CRISTINA SCHERRER-SCHAUB / Translation, Transmis- sion, Tradition: Suggestions from Ninth-Century Tibet	67-77
LAMBERT SCHMITHAUSEN / A Further Note on Hetucakradamaru 8-9	79-82
FRANCESCO SFERRA / The Concept of Purification in Some Texts of Late Indian Buddhism	83-103
FRITS STAAL / Greek and Vedic Geometry	105-127
RAFFAELE TORELLA / "Devī uvāca", or the Theology of the Perfect Tense	129-138
ALBRECHT WEZLER / Medhātithi on <i>Sāmānyato Drṣṭam</i> [<i>Anumānam</i>]	139-157



KAMALESWAR BHATTACHARYA

PHYLLIS GRANOFF

INTRODUCTION

It is a pleasure and an honor to dedicate this issue of the *Journal of Indian Philosophy* to Kamaleśvar Bhattacharya on the occasion of his retirement from the formal academic world, but by no means from active scholarship. As his bibliography amply demonstrates, the study of Indian philosophy owes much to this one man, who through his meticulous text editions, annotated translations and articles has deepened our understanding of the history and development of Indian thought. Kamaleśvar has also had a major influence on the study of Indian philosophy through his unceasing efforts to train students and his generosity to his colleagues. Many of us, spread out all over the world, have turned to Kamaleśvar with our questions and come away enriched by his insights. And then there is the less tangible influence he has had on all of us simply through the enormously high standards he set in his writings and presentations.

Kamaleśvar Bhattacharya was born in a little village in what is now Bangladesh. He studied in Calcutta, Paris and at the Sanskrit University in Varanasi. In September 1955 a French Government Scholarship brought him to Paris, under the condition that he work on an area of Indology that was a particular specialty of French scholarship. At that time Indo-China most closely fit this requirement. The great French Sanskritists Auguste Barth, Abel Bergaigne and Louis Finot had edited and translated Sanskrit inscriptions from Cambodia and Champa. George Coedès, a man whom Kamaleśvar has called "the greatest scholar in the field for all times", was bringing to completion his monumental work, *Inscriptions du Cambodge*.

In February 1962 Kamaleśvar was awarded the Doctorat ès Lettres (Doctorat d'Etat) with the "mention très honorable". The two works, *Les Religions brahmaïques dans l'ancien Cambodge, d'après l'épigraphie et l'iconographie* (1961) and *Recherches sur le vocabulaire des inscriptions sanskrites du Cambodge* (1964 and 1991), that resulted from his doctoral research are considered by scholars in the field as classics in Khmerology. Kamaleśvar still works on Cambodia, particularly in response to the many invitations he receives to contribute articles to publications on the subject. Recently he wrote the chapter on the reli-

gions of Cambodia for the catalogue of the Angkor exhibition held in Paris and Washington. He has been correcting the translations and readings of the Sanskrit inscriptions from Cambodia in the editions of Barth, Bergaigne, Finot and Coedès. He is one of the only scholars who has the knowledge required for this task, and Khmerology will owe him a great debt for this labor.

Soon after receiving his degree Kamaleśvar turned to the more classical branches of Indology, particularly philosophy. His long association with Louis Renou (1956–1966, when Renou passed away), shaped his philological outlook and has guided him in all of his work. His next book *L'ātman-Brahman dans le Bouddhisme ancien* (1973), which was based on an extensive study of the Pali Canon and the relevant Sanskrit sources, grew out of his earlier studies on Cambodia. He subsequently turned to later Buddhist philosophies, including Madhyamaka philosophy and select issues in Buddhist epistemology. His annotated translation of the *Vigrahavyāvartanī* and his articles on the grammatical basis of Nāgārjuna's thought remain models of scholarship for the coming generations of scholars.

For the last thirty years Kamaleśvar has published widely on different branches of Indian thought, philosophy, logic, semantics and poetics. He has almost completed his annotated translation of a Navya-Nyāya work, the *Siddhāntalakṣaṇaprakarana* of the *Tattvacintāmani* of Gaṅgeśa with the *Dīdhiti* of Raghunātha Śiromāṇi and the *Tikā* of Jagadīśa Tarkālamkāra. He also expects soon to publish his edition of Yajñapati Upādhyāya's *Tattvacintāmaniprabhā* (*Anumānakhaṇḍa*). This is the earliest commentary to the *Tattvacintāmani* known so far. In his work on these texts, Kamaleśvar has focused on the close relationship in India between the science of grammar and philosophical thinking.

Throughout his career Kamaleśvar has held many positions of distinction and received many well deserved honors. Thanks to the support of Louis Renou, he entered the Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique in Paris in 1960 as Attaché de Recherche. He retired from there as Directeur de Recherche in September 1996. During the same period he also taught as a Visiting Professor at Brown University (1967–69), at the University of Toronto (1977 and 1979), at Viśva-Bhāratī University, Śāntiniketan (1980) and at the Adyar Library and Research Center, Madras (1994, 1995). Kamaleśvar remembers with particular fondness his days at Brown University. The Vietnam war was at its height and he found himself suddenly in the position of friend and counselor to the many students who struggled with their conscience and the demands of their government.

Over the last twenty-five years, Kamaleśvar has traveled extensively in the West and in Asia, giving lectures, conducting seminars, and chairing meetings at international conferences. He has also been engaged in a search for Sanskrit manuscripts, particularly in China and Tibet.

In 1978 upon the retirement of Jean Filliozat, Kamaleśvar agreed to let his name stand as a candidate for the Sanskrit chair at the College de France. After securing a majority of votes from those who were in favor of maintaining the chair, he learned that the chair would be abolished. This was the oldest Sanskrit chair in the world, having been established in 1814, and Kamaleśvar would have only brought it the highest honor. In 1996 the Asiatic Society of Calcutta (founded 1784) honored him with a gold medal.

KAMALESWAR BHATTACHARYA BIBLIOGRAPHY

BOOKS AND MONOGRAPHS

Les Religions brahmaïques dans l'ancien Cambodge, d'après l'épigraphie et l'iconographie. Publications de l'Ecole française d'Extrême-Orient, vol. XLIX. Paris, 1961. Translated into Thai by Prof. M.C. Subhadradis Diskul.

Rabindranath Tagore: Le Vagabond et autres histoires. Traduit du bengali par C. Bossennec et K. Bhattacharya. Paris: Gallimard, 1962. Reprinted 1983.

L'Ātman-Brahman dans le Bouddhisme ancien. Publications de l'Ecole française d'Extrême-Orient, vol. XC. Paris, 1973.

The Dialectical Method of Nāgārjuna (*Vigrahavyāvartanī*). Delhi: Motilal Banarsi Dass, 1978, 1986, 1990; fourth edition, 1998.

Recherches sur le vocabulaire des inscriptions sanskrites du Cambodge. Publications de l'Ecole française d'Extrême-Orient, vol. CLXVII. Paris, 1991.

Le Siddhāntalakṣaṇaprakaraṇa du Tattvacintāmaṇi de Gaṅgeśa, avec la Dīdhiti de Raghunātha Śiromāṇi et la Tīkā de Jagadīśa Tarkālamkāra. Texte traduit et commenté. Journal Asiatique (Paris), 1977: 97–139; 1978: 97–124; 1980: 275–322; 1982: 401–413; 1984: 47–82; 1988: 147–162; 1991: 289–325; 1995: 373–406 (to be continued).

Some thoughts on Early Buddhism with special reference to its Relation to the Upaniṣads. Acharya Dharmananda Kosambi Memorial Lectures at the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute, Poona, 1997. Published 1998: Post-graduate and Research Department Series No. 41.

Edition of Yajñapati Upādhyāya's *Tattvacintāmaṇiprabhā* (Anumānakhaṇḍa). Asiatic Society, Calcutta (Bibliotheca Indica). To appear.

ARTICLES

1953

The Aṣṭamūrti Concept of Śiva in India, Indo-China and Indonesia, Indian Historical Quarterly (Calcutta) XXIX: 233–241.

1955

A Note on Aśoka's R.E. VI, Bhāratīya-Vidyā (Bombay) XV: 6–8.
Some Aspects of Temple Administration in the Ancient Khmer Kingdom, Calcutta Review, Third Series, 134: 193–199.
The Pāñcarātra Sect in Ancient Cambodia, Journal of the Greater India Society (Calcutta) XIV: 111–116.
La secte des Pāśupata dans l'ancien Cambodge, Journal Asiatique (Paris) CCXLIII: 479–490.
Etude sur l'iconographie de Banteay Samrè, Arts asiatiques (Paris) II: 294–308.

1956

Notes d'iconographie khmère, Arts asiatiques III: 183–194.

1957

Notes d'iconographie khmère, Arts asiatiques IV: 208–220, 293–296.

1958

Notes d'iconographie khmère, Arts asiatiques V: 217–220.
An Unpublished Gaṇeśa Image from Cambodia, Artibus Asiae (Ascona) XXI: 269–270.

1961

Précisions sur la paléographie de l'inscription dite de Vo-canhh, Artibus Asiae (Festschrift George Cœdès): 219–224.

1964

Hari Kambujendra, Artibus Asiae XXVII: 72–78.
Notes d'iconographie khmère, Arts asiatiques X: 91–94.
Note sur le śivapada, Journal Asiatique CCLII: 379–381.
Recherches sur le vocabulaire des inscriptions sanskrites du Cambodge, Bulletin de l'Ecole française d'Extrême-Orient LII: 1–72.

1965

Sur une stonce d'une inscription sanskrite du Cambodge, Journal Asiatique CCLIII: 407–409.
Notes d'iconographie khmère, Arts asiatiques XI: 45–51.

1966

Liṅga-Kośa, Essays offered to G.H. Luce (Ascona: Artibus Asiae), vol. II: 6–13.
Notes d'iconographie khmère, Arts asiatiques XIII: 111–113.
Supplément aux Recherches sur le vocabulaire des inscriptions sanskrites du Cambodge, Bulletin de l'Ecole française d'Extrême-Orient LIII: 273–277.

1967

Le "védisme" de certains textes hindouistes, Journal Asiatique CCLV: 199–222.
A propos de Somaśarman, Journal Asiatique CCLV: 223–226.
A propos de niṣkala-liṅga, Journal Asiatique CCLV: 227–229.

1968

Upadhi-, upādi- et upādāna- dans le Canon bouddhique pāli, Mélanges d'indianisme à la mémoire de Louis Renou (Paris): 81–95.
Translated into Japanese by Yusho Wakahara, Bulletin of Institute of Buddhist Cultural Studies, Ryukoku University (Kyoto) 24 (1985): 22–37.

1969

Supplément aux Recherches sur le vocabulaire des inscriptions sanskrites du Cambodge, Bulletin de l'Ecole française d'Extrême-Orient LV: 145–151.

1970

Religious Speculations in Ancient Cambodia, R.C. Majumdar Felicitation Volume (Calcutta): 78–97.

1971

The Dialectical method of Nāgārjuna, Journal of Indian Philosophy I (Th. Stcherbatsky Centennial Issue): 217–261.
Note sur le Vedānta dans l'inscription de Prè Rup (Cambodge), Journal Asiatique CCLIX: 99–101.

1971

Sāntarasa et Advaita: à propos d'un livre récent, Journal Asiatique CCLX: 89–105.

1974

A Note on the interpretation of the term sādhyasama in Madhyamaka texts, Journal of Indian Philosophy 2: 225–230.

1975

Mādhyamika et Vaitāṇḍika, Journal Asiatique CCLXIII: 99–102.
A Note on the term yoga in Nyāyabhāṣya and Nyāyavārttika on I, 1, 29, Indologica Taurinensia II: 39–43.
On Brahman in Buddhist Literature, Sri Venkateswara University Oriental Journal (Tirupati) XVIII: 1–8.

1976

Sur un passage difficile de la Siddhāntalakṣaṇa-Jāgadīśī, Journal Asiatique CCLXIV: 57–62.

1977

On Anyonyābhāva, Indologica Taurinensia V: 37–41.
On the Relationship between the Vigrahavyāvartanī and the Nyāyasūtras, Journal of Indo-European Studies 5: 265–273.

1978

The literary value of the inscriptions – Sanskrit and Sanskritic – outside India, The Cultural Heritage of India (Calcutta) VI: 407–416.
Some Notes on the Vigrahavyāvartanī, Journal of Indian Philosophy 5: 237–241.
Recherches sur le Navya-nyāya: bilan et perspectives, Indologica Taurinensia VI: 63–68.

1979

The Ātman in two Prajñāpāramitā-Sūtras, Our Heritage (Sanskrit College, Calcutta), 150th Anniversary Volume: 39–45.
Notes bouddhiques, Indologica Taurinensia VII (L. Sternbach Felicitation Volume): 107–113.
On a passage of the Siddhāntalakṣaṇa-Jāgadīśī, L. Sternbach Felicitation Volume (Lucknow): 479–483.
Les arguments de Jagadīśa pour établir la parole comme moyen de connaissance vraie (pramāṇa), Śabdaśaktiprakāśikā, kārikā I–V avec le commentaire de l'auteur lui-même. Texte traduit et commenté. Journal Asiatique CCLXVII: 155–189.
Nairātmyavādāḥ, Saṃskṛta-sāhitya-pariṣat (Calcutta) LXII: 63–70 (Text of a lecture given in Sanskrit in 1975 at the Sanskrit University, Darbhanga).

1980

Dīṭṭhaṁ Sutam Mutam Viññātam, Buddhist Studies in honour of Walpola Rahula (London and Sri Lanka): 10–15.
Nāgārjuna's Arguments against Motion: Their Grammatical Basis, A Corpus of Indian Studies: Essays in Honour of Professor Gaurinath Sastri (Calcutta): 85–95.

1981

The Grammatical Basis of Nāgārjuna's Arguments: Some Further Considerations, *Indologica Taurinensia VIII–IX* (L. Sternbach Commemoration Volume): 35–43.

1983

Ratnākaraśānti and Ratnakīrti, Surabhi: E.R. Sreekrishna Sarma Felicitation Volume (Tirupati): 131–140.

1984

La signification du Madhyamaka: Reconsidération des arguments de Nāgārjuna contre le mouvement, *Cultura Sánscrita: Memoria del Primer Simposio Internacional de Lengua Sánscrita* (México: Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México): 189–199. (Cf. *Vidhushekha Bhattacharya Commemoration Volume*, Visva-Bharati, Santiniketan; *Les Cahiers de Philosophie* 14/1992: 171–181.)

The Present State of Researches on the Sanskrit Epigraphy of Cambodia, *Amṛtadhārā*: R.N. Dandekar Felicitation Volume (Delhi): 475–484. (Cf. *Indus Valley to Mekong Delta: Explorations in Epigraphy*, ed. by Noboru Karashima, Madras, 1985: 301–302.) Translated into Thai by Chirapat Prapandvidya, in *Archaeological Research* (Special issue: to commemorate its 40th Anniversary): 45–55.

1985

Nāgārjuna's Arguments against Motion, *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* 8: 7–15.

The Anātman Concept in Buddhism, *Proceedings of the Sixth International Symposium on Asian Studies* (Hong Kong): 1023–1034. (Cf. *Kaviraj Commemoration Volume*, Varanasi, 1987.)

1986

Some Thoughts on Antarvyāpti, Bahiryāpti, and Trairūpya, in B.K. Matilal and R.D. Evans (eds.), *Buddhist Logic and Epistemology* (Dordrecht): 89–105.

Notes bouddhiques, *Journal Asiatique CCLXXIV*: 291–300.

Bheda and Samṣarga in Indian Semantics, B.R. Sharma Felicitation Volume (Tirupati): 22–31.

1987

A Note on the Buddhist Syllogism, *Philosophical Essays*: Professor Anantalal Thakur Felicitation Volume (Calcutta): 7–10.

Lexicographical Gleanings from the Sanskrit Epigraphy of Cambodia, *Indological Studies*: Prof. D.C. Sircar Commemoration Volume (New Delhi): 35–38.

The Criterion of Orthodoxy in India and the Case of Jainism and Buddhism, *Śramaṇa-Vidyā, Studies in Buddhism*: Professor Jagannath Upadhyaya Commemoration Volume (Sarnath) I: 101–109.

Two Notes on the Interpretation of Indian Philosophy, *Annals of the Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute* (Poona) LXVIII (R.G. Bhandarkar 150th Birth-Anniversary Volume): 305–308.

1988

Yajñapatyupādhyāyaviracitāyām Tattvacintāmaṇiprabhāyām Īśvaravādavyākhyānam, Lokaprajñā: Prof. N.S. Rāmānuja Tātācārya Felicitation Volume (Puri): 275–294.

1989

Brahman in the Pāli Canon and in the Pāli Commentaries, *Amalā Prajñā: Aspects of Buddhist Studies*, Professor P.V. Bapat Felicitation Volume (Delhi): 15–31.

Some Thoughts on Ātman-Brahman in Early Buddhism, Dr. B.M. Barua Birth Centenary Commemoration Volume (Calcutta: Baudha Dharmakur Sabha): 63–83.

A Note on svabhāva in Madhyamaka, *Indian Journal of Buddhist Studies* (Varanasi) I.2: 1–3.

Textual Observations on the Vienna Edition of Yajñapati Upādhyāya's *Tattvacintāmaṇiprabhā* (*Anumānakhaṇḍa*), in V.N. Jha (ed.), *New Horizons of Research in Indology* (Poona): 108–138.

1991

Marginal Notes on antarvyāpti, in E. Steinkellner (ed.), *Studies in the Buddhist Epistemological Tradition* (Wien): 1–2.

1992

Sanskrit Epigraphy of Cambodia: Where does it stand? *Visva-Bharati Quarterly*, New Series, vol. 2: 186–190.

Note sur la base technique de la pensée indienne, *Asiatische Studien/Etudes asiatiques* XLVI.1 (Etudes bouddhiques offertes à Jacques May): 49–55.

Réalisme ontologique et opportunisme grammatical dans l'*Abhidharmadīpa* et la *Vibhāṣāprabhāvṛtti*, *Buddhist Studies Present and Future*. Tenth International Conference of the International Association of Buddhist Studies, Summary Report (Paris, UNESCO): 8–9, 74–76.

Nāgārjuna (with a Thai translation by Chirapat Prapandvidya), Buddha Exhibition (Bangkok): 39–48 (Text of a lecture given at the Buddhist Mahachulalankarn University, Bangkok).

1993

A Note on *anātman* in the Work of Étienne Lamotte, *Premier Colloque Étienne Lamotte* (Louvain-la-Neuve): 25–26.

Note sur les mots moyen-indiens dans les inscriptions en vieux-khmèr, *Journal Asiatique* CCLXXXI: 393–395.

The Language of *Nāgārjuna's* Sanskrit Texts, in K.N. Mishra (ed.), *Aspects of Buddhist Sanskrit* (Sarnath): 220–224.

Grammarians and Philosophers. On the *anuśāsana*: na karmadhārayān matvarthīyo bahuvrīhiś cet tadartha pratipattikarah, *Researches in Indian & Buddhist Philosophy: Essays in Honour of Professor Alex Wayman* (Delhi): 203–207.

1994

Some Observations on the Sanskrit Epigraphy of Cambodia, *Corolla Torontonensis: Studies in honour of Ronald Morton Smith* (Toronto: TSAR): 225–228.

1995

Back to *Nāgārjuna* and Grammar, *Brahmavidyā*, Adyar Library Bulletin 59 (C. Kunhan Raja Birth Centenary Volume): 178–189.

Notes lexicographiques sur les inscriptions du Cambodge, *Journal Asiatique* 283: 209–212.

1996

A Note on Identity and Mutual Absence in *Navya-nyāya*, B.K. Matilal Commemoration Volume (Oxford University Press): 224–230.

A Note on *svabhāva* in *Madhyamaka*, His Holiness the Dalai Lama Felicitation Volume (Delhi): 333–336.

Sur la base grammaticale de la pensée indienne, in N. Balbir et G.-J. Pinault (eds.), *Langue, style et structure*, Centenaire de Louis Renou (Paris): 171–186.

1997

Once more on a passage of the *Alagaddūpama-sutta*, *Baudhavyāsudhākarah*: Studies in Honour of Heinz Bechert on the occasion of his 65th Birthday (Swisttal-Odendorf): 25–28. L'état actuel des travaux sur l'épigraphie sanskrite du Cambodge, *Journal Asiatique* 285: 301–309.

Religious Syncretism in Ancient Cambodia, *Dharmadūta: Mélanges offerts au Vénérable Thích Huyễn-Vi* (Paris: Editions You-Feng): 1–12. Some Thoughts on the Indian Conceptions of Poetic Expression, India and Beyond, *Aspects of Literature, Meaning, Ritual and Thought: Essays in honour of Frits Staal* (Leiden and Amsterdam): 1–13.

Les religions du Cambodge ancien et l'épigraphie sanskrite, in *Angkor et dix siècles d'art khmer* (Paris: Réunion des musées nationaux): 34–52 (The Religions of Ancient Cambodia, in *Sculpture of Angkor and Ancient Cambodia: Millenium of Glory*, Washington: National Gallery of Art: 34–52).

A Note on the *anattā* passage of the *Mahānidāna-sutta*, Prof. Y. Karunadasa Felicitation Volume (Colombo and Hong Kong): 47–50. Les navagraha et les “neuf divinités”, Papers in Honor of Professor Jean Boisselier, Bangkok, Silpakorn University, 1997: 91–94.

1998

L'état actuel de la lexicographie sanskrite concernant l'Asie du Sud-Est, in Boris Oguibénine (ed.), *Lexicography in the Indian and Buddhist Cultural Field: Proceedings of the Conference at the University of Strasbourg, 25 to 27 April 1996* (München: Kommission für zentralasiatische Studien, Bayerische Akademie der Wissenschaften, *Studia Tibetica IV*): 31–37.

Forthcoming:

Summary of Nāgārjuna's *Vigrahavyāvartanī*, in Karl H. Potter (ed.), *Encyclopedia of Indian Philosophies* (*Mahāyāna Buddhist Philosophy*). Once more on two passages of the Pāli Canon, *Indologica Taurinensia*.

REVIEWS AND OTHER PUBLICATIONS

1963

Marie-Thérèse de Mallmann, *Les enseignements iconographiques de l'Agni-Purāṇa* (Paris, 1963), *Journal of the Asiatic Society* (Calcutta), Fourth Series, vol. V: 121–123.

1966

Ishtiaq Husain Qureshi, the Muslim Community of the Indo-Pakistan Subcontinent (610-1947): A brief historical analysis (Publications in Near and Middle East Studies, Columbia University, Series A, I, 's Gravenhage: Mouton, 1962), and Suniti Kumar Chatterji, Indianism and the Indian Synthesis (Calcutta, 1962), *Journal Asiatique* CCLIV: 515–517.

1969

Bijan Raj Chatterji, *Indian Cultural Influence in Cambodia* (second edition, Calcutta, 1964), *Artibus Asiae* XXXI: 224.

1972

Mireille Bénisti, Rapports entre le premier art khmer et l'art indien (Paris, 1970), *Artibus Asiae* XXXIV: 261–262.

1978

J.L. Masson and M.V. Patwardhan, *Aesthetic Rapture. The Rasādhyāya of the Nātyaśāstra* (Poona, 1970), *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 98: 192–193.

1983

Hommage à Monsieur Jean Filliozat (1906–1982), *Bulletin d'études indiennes* (Paris) I: 3–6.

1984

Marie-Claude Porcher, Figures de style en sanskrit. Théories des Alāmkāraśāstra. Analyse de poèmes de Veṅkaṭādhvarin, *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 104: 339–340.

1985

On the Loss of a Unique Sanskrit manuscript, *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 105: 725.

1986

Gopikamohan Bhattacharya (ed.), Yajñapati Upādhyāya's *Tattvacintāmaṇiprabhā* (*Anumānakhaṇḍaḥ*) [Wien, 1984], *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 14: 405–411.

1991

Claus Oetke, "Ich" und das Ich. Analytische Untersuchungen zur buddhistisch-brahmanischen Ātmankontroverse (Stuttgart, 1988), *Bulletin d'études indiennes* 9: 279–281.

1994

Cristina Anna Scherrer-Schaub, *Yuktīśāstikāvṛtti*. Commentaire à la soixantaine sur le raisonnement ou Du vrai enseignement de la causalité par le Maître indien Candrakīrti (Bruxelles, 1991), *Journal of Indian Philosophy* 22: 391–393.

Martin Mittwede, Textkritische Bemerkungen zur Kāṭhaka-Saṃhitā (Stuttgart, 1989), *Brahmavidyā*, Adyar Library Bulletin 58: 280–281.

1996

L'Harmonie dans la différence, L'Art Messager de Paix (UNESCO). "Geleitwort" to Hans P. Sturm, *Weder Sein noch Nichtsein* (Würzburg: Ergon Verlag).

Ernst Steinkellner und Michael Torsten Much, Texte der erkenntnistheoretischen Schule des Buddhismus. Systematische Übersicht über die buddhistische Sanskrit-Literatur (Systematic Survey of Buddhist Sanskrit Literature) II, mit einem Vorwort von Heinz Bechert (Göttingen, 1995), Bulletin d'études indiennes 13–14: 528–530.

AKIHIKO AKAMATSU

THE TWO KINDS OF *ANUMĀNA* IN BHARTṛHARI'S
VĀKYAPADĪYA

In his *Vākyapadīya*, Bhartṛhari uses the word '*anumāna*' 13 times. In most cases it is employed in emphasizing indirectness or incompleteness of a cognition.¹ It seems that no technical definition is presupposed when Bhartṛhari uses this word. *Kārikā* 189 of the second *Kāṇḍa*, however, is the only place in the *Vākyapadīya* where the term '*anumāna*' has a technical meaning. *Kārikā* 2.189 runs as follows:

*sthādibhiḥ kevalair yac ca gamanādi na gamyate/
tatrānumānād dvividhāt taddharma prādir ucyatell*

[The verb '*prasthā-*' means 'to set out',] but [the meaning of] 'going' is not understood from the isolated root '*sthā-*'. In this case, it is said that [the prefix] '*pra-*' is the conveyer of [the meaning of] 'going', on the basis of the two kinds of *anumāna*.

This *kārikā* represents the view that the prefixes including '*pra-*' and others reveal the meaning that also is possessed potentially by the root; they are *dyotaka*. The point of importance is that Bhartṛhari refers to the two kinds of *anumāna* in this verse. As far as I know, Bhartṛhari makes no explicit statement about the twofold distinction of *anumāna* in any other place in his *Vākyapadīya*. His silence corresponds to the fact that this *kārikā* was propounded on the presupposition that everyone knew about the two kinds of *anumāna*. Now, taking this into account, we can ask the following question: Which *anumānas* does Bhartṛhari have in mind when he puts forward this view? To answer this question we shall investigate the *Vṛtti*. The *Vṛtti* on this *kārikā* runs as follows:²

In one case a conclusion is drawn by the *dṛṣṭam anumānam*, in another case by the *sāmānyato dṛṣṭam anumānam*. Between the two, [the former is as follows:] The prefix '*pra-*' in this verb '*prasthā-*' was seen before in some other verb being able to reveal the meaning of 'the beginning of an action'. [From this experienced fact,] it follows that it (the prefix '*pra-*') now in this case also has the same meaning. On the other hand, [the latter is as follows:] It is well known that among all the other verbs roots of the same kind have several different meanings. Then, in this case of the verb '*prasthā-*', it follows that the root '*sthā-*' also is the conveyer of the meaning of 'going to another place', which is not perceptible.

The main point of this argument is that the prefix '*pra-*' can reveal the sense which the verb root '*sthā-*' has potentially. This